THE ROLE OF SOCIAL NETWORKING SERVICES TO SHAPE THE DOUBLE VIRTUAL CITIZENSHIP OF YOUNG IMMIGRANTS IN ITALY

Marco Lazzari
Faculty of Educational Studies
University of Bergamo
Piazzale Sant'Agostino 2
Bergamo ITALY

ABSTRACT
In this paper, we will describe an ongoing research on the communication styles of immigrant adolescents in Italy. Following a comparison of native and immigrant high school students, based on their responses to questionnaires and interviews, we began a series of interviews and focus groups with immigrant students, which led us to propose and use what we call the immigrants' double virtual citizenship as a key to understand the use of social networks among young immigrants. The double tension of young immigrants, towards their homeland on one side, towards their new country on the other side, might be profitably exploited to build bridges among different cultures.

KEYWORDS
Social networks; young immigrants; immigration; citizenship; membership; citizenship education

1. INTRODUCTION
In this paper we present and discuss the preliminary results of an ongoing research on the communication styles of immigrant adolescents in Italy. It is intended as a case study of media ethnography, based on quantitative and qualitative analyses, driven by the concern of groups of educators and parents to understand modes and loci of communication among adolescents and by the educational aim to leverage social networking services as places and tools to create favorable conditions for promoting the social and political integration of the immigrants, help foreign students to participate freely in their new community, and encourage reciprocal understanding and enrichment for both immigrants and natives.

The article is organized into four sections: an introduction describes the transformation of Italy, from where in the past millions of people emigrated mainly to America and Western Europe, and which currently is intended as a destination country or at least as a transition country for large migratory movements, mainly from Africa, Eastern Europe and China; then we describe the first phase of our research, which involved about 4,000 respondents (natives and immigrants); the following section describes the second stage of the research, that involved some dozens of immigrants, who were interviewed about their communication styles when using social networks; the final chapter discusses the findings of the research and provides some insights on possible educational perspectives and applications.

2. ITALY FROM EMIGRATION TO IMMIGRATION
From the unification of the Kingdom of Italy in 1861, and until the Italian economic miracle in the 1960s, Italy has experienced a very long period of large-scale migration, mainly to extra-European countries.

It has been estimated that this process involved approximately 28 million Italians, an astonishing number, provided that the Italian population in 1861, at the beginning of the emigration flow, was estimated at around 25 million (see Table 1 for some data about the main communities of people of Italian descent).
Table 1. Some of the main “Italian” communities abroad

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Citizens of Italian descent</th>
<th>% of the total population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>25,000,000</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>20,000,000</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S.A.</td>
<td>17,000,000</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1,500,000</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Over the past twenty years Italy has become a destination for mass immigration, mainly from Eastern Europe, South America and Africa, and the Italian society is very rapidly changing towards a multicultural society from one side, towards an obligatory passage point from the other side: recent political crises in several north-African regions have tragically highlighted the role of Italy as a bridge from Africa to Europe for people who flee their countries.

According to recent estimates (Caritas/Migrantes 2010), there are currently around five million immigrants in Italy (that is about 8% of the total population), while 10 years ago there were fewer than two million immigrants. According to the same source, approximately 670,000 students in Italian schools (about 7.5% of the total number) are foreign-born or "second generations", mainly from Romania, Albania, Morocco, China and Ecuador.

As in other countries, this large and sudden wave of immigration is creating problems in terms of social acceptance and inclusion: despite a growing scholarly consensus on the idea that immigration usually does not increase criminality, whereas often suppresses it (Rumbaut and Ewing 2007; Lee and Martinez, 2009), popular stereotypes as well as predictions of classic criminological theories are hard to dispel, as immigrants often generate feelings of anxiety, lack of security and fear (Bauman 2006), which are emphasized by a society in which the well-knit communities of the past have been substituted by networks of independent individuals (Castel 2003).

Our research tries to face the presence of such a large number of foreign students in Italian schools from an educational perspective: we have decided to investigate whether modern communication and information technologies, which are often inherently structured as networks of various elements (computers, clients, users), might offer tools and opportunities to foster inclusive processes (Dekelver and Van den Bosch 2009), that is to create favorable conditions for promoting new forms of citizenship education towards the political integration of the newcomers (Faist, Gerdes and Reaple 2007), help non-native students to participate freely in the transformation of their new community (Freire 2007), encourage reciprocal understanding and mutual enrichment for immigrants and natives and lead to an increase of cross-cultural communication, interaction, contamination and co-inclusion.

3. MODES AND LOCI OF COMMUNICATION AMONG ADOLESCENTS IN ITALY

Our research began in 2008, using stimuli and requests for help from groups of teachers and parents of high-school students, who were interested in identifying, interpreting and understanding modes and loci of communication among adolescents, both in the real and virtual world.

The first stage of this research (Lazzari and Jacono Quarantino 2010) was developed between autumn 2008 and summer 2009 using a mixed methods approach involving different techniques, ranging from large-scale questionnaires to long individual interviews. This stage involved about 4000 respondents.

At the core of the data gathering process was a questionnaire of 107 questions which was administered to 1402 high school students in Bergamo (Italy), aged from 14 to 18 years old, randomly chosen from the population of high schools in the area (De Fiori, Lazzari and Jacono Quarantino 2010); among them, 101 were foreign students (7.2%).

The questions, which were mostly closed-ended, aimed at focusing on:

• personal data;
• usage of communication instruments (mobile phones, mp3 players, etc.);
• usage of spare time;
• modes of communication with friends;
• Internet usage;
• Internet usage by parents.

The data analysis highlighted some interesting issues. Some of our findings confirmed our expectations and/or the results of other studies, while others were rather surprising. For instance, according to our respondents, they were still exposed to television more frequently than the Internet; with regard to Internet usage, in agreement with other studies (such as Kumar, Yadav and Helmy 2008), we can say that gender matters and predicts usage: even if boys and girls use the Internet at more or less the same frequency, males spend more time online.

Surprisingly, we found no evidence that access to the Internet was positively correlated with the economic status of the families, in contrast to what has been suggested by previous studies in similar areas (Aslanidou and Menexes 2008). We did not ask our respondents about their family budget, but it is well known that in Italy there is a non-uniform distribution of students’ socio-economic status across different types of school, and the highest levels of Internet usage were found in vocational schools (confirmed by odds ratio analysis), in which the majority of students traditionally come from the lower classes.

Immigrant students, who are mainly enrolled in vocational schools (60%), are, in fact, frequent Internet users, with longer usage sessions than their Italian peers (see Table 2). Nonetheless, there is a significant difference in the proportion of native teens who have broadband access in the home when compared to broadband access in immigrant households: 86% versus 61%; these data are coherent with previous studies (Hoffmann and Novak 1998; Lenhart et al. 2008), which pointed out that ethnic minority groups have less access to computers at home.

Table 2. Time spent on line (daily)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Less than 1 hour</th>
<th>From 1 to 2 hours</th>
<th>More than 2 hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natives</td>
<td>30.7%</td>
<td>40.8%</td>
<td>28.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigrants</td>
<td>25.7%</td>
<td>34.7%</td>
<td>39.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The most general evidence from the questionnaire is that the information and communication technologies do not isolate young people, as often teachers and parents imagine and fear. On the contrary, Internet tools help teens stay connected with friends and have richer social experiences in the so-called real world: in agreement with Itami et al. (2011), we have spotted correlations between data that allow us to say that frequent users of the Internet are also those who most often go to the cinema, practice sports, go out with friends; the more adolescents use the Internet, the more chances they have of social interactions with friends outside the net.

The net is therefore used as a relational prosthesis, that fosters a co-evolution of people and environment, and allows teenagers to build bridges to the Other and does not exclude, but rather enforces the personal relationship in presence, to which it constantly refers.

Another interesting finding was related to the real loci, where teenagers meet each other and spend their spare time: our data show that, for adolescents, the shopping mall is a meeting place of choice, third favorite behind home and pub (35% of choices, three choices per respondent), widely preferred over youth centers, downtown squares, religious facilities or entertainment venues such as night clubs and discothèques. For immigrants the percentage for malls (second favorite, 44%) is even higher than that for pubs (41%). These data suggest that the shopping centre is a place where adolescents gather not by chance, nor only in order to buy something, but also to socialize, meet friends and have fun. Whilst for many adults shopping malls are (at least in Italy) still prejudicially regarded as non-places (Augé 1995), where people come and pass through without interacting, they seem to be natively concerned with the identity of the digital native generation. We believe that this phenomenon is an effect of the diffusion among young people of telecommunication services and mobile devices: since malls in our region are located in suburban zones, which are not easy to be reached by teens, only an efficient network of digital relationships may help them synchronize and organize their meetings.
4. YOUNG IMMIGRANTS, SOCIAL NETWORKS, ROOTS AND BRIDGES

Considering the general framework shown in the previous section, we were rather astonished by the figures regarding the use of social networks among the students of our sample of adolescents, as immigrants seemed to use Facebook less than their native peers. Therefore, we embarked upon a second stage of the research, with the aim of providing new evidence for (or against) this phenomenon and interpreting it (Fasola 2011; Lazzari 2011).

From a methodological point of view, we decided to change the tool used for gathering data, and scheduled a series of long semi-structured interviews with a narrower target group of foreign-born students (in Italy from $\mu=6.8$ years, $\sigma=1.8$).

After some initial focus groups, a grid of approximately 80 questions was prepared and administered to a group of 19 adolescent immigrants (7 from Morocco, 3 from India and Bolivia, 2 from Colombia and Ivory Coast, 1 from Ghana and Senegal), whom we contacted at a vocational school in Bergamo downtown and in a parish youth club of a neighborhood.

About 15 questions were aimed at identifying the interviewee (age, sex, school, nationality, family structure, religion, …), 10 at describing media commonly used (Internet, television, chat, social networks, …), 35 were specifically on Facebook use and 20 on instant messaging services (interviewees were assured that their anonymity would be protected).

The series of interviews is still in progress with other students, as well as some focus groups involving about thirty students, and a new large scale questionnaire with new questions was launched in the spring of 2012, with the aim of contacting more than thousand students; but the preliminary evidence seems to be enough to shed light on the issue of immigrants’ relatively low usage of Facebook.

In fact, we now understand that the problem was not in the answers, but in the questions, which were misplaced: when asking about the length of time for which students used Internet tools, we gave them a list of the most popular services (Facebook, MySpace, Second Life, Netlog, etc.) which had been selected according to the feelings of the research team and confirmed using feedback from discussions with students, parents and teachers, as well as by a pilot study with 70 students using preliminary versions of the questionnaire itself and a rehearsal with a quasi-final release and a dozen of students.

Unfortunately, almost all of our testers were natives, and nobody raised one important issue: although services such as Facebook and Twitter are widely used worldwide, in some countries, the dominant social network is not on the list of the most popular services in Italy (and in many other Western countries). For instance, when we gathered our data in 2009, social networks such as Orkut and Hi5 were dominant in India and in many countries in South America.

Our interviews revealed that many of the immigrants who came from countries where the dominant social networking website was not Facebook tended to develop two different social networks (i.e. social structures or networks of contacts) using two different social networking services (i.e. an online platform to manage social relations): Facebook for their Italian\(^1\) relationships, and another service for relationships in their country of origin.

This is the reason for the reduced use of Facebook, and it also means that young immigrants develop two separate virtual communities and what we call a *double virtual citizenship*. We can argue that even those who use a single networking service (typically Facebook) for both Italian and motherland relationships experience the same double belonging, by developing (at least\(^2\)) two different social networks within the same social networking service.

---

\(^1\) Here, when we say "Italian" we mean that we are addressing "friends" who live in Italy (or even abroad, but not related to the motherland), no matter they are Italian citizens or not

\(^2\) In fact, it is well known that people usually belong to multiple social networks (family, work, friends, acquaintances, …), that they manage to keep separate.
5. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

This discovery of the existence of this form of double citizenship is important from our educational viewpoint, as the reduced usage of mainstream social networks, which have recently been identified as a possible vehicle for inclusive teaching strategies, could prove to be problematic for the design and implementation of such strategies.

On the other hand, the double virtual citizenship allows ties to be maintained with a cultural milieu which may have a positive influence on the identity-building process of our students.

Intentionally, we prefer the adjective double instead of dual, which is commonly used in the expression "dual citizenship", to distinguish the latter static and official condition which occurs when an individual is a citizen of two countries at the same time, from the dynamic, transitory phenomenon of taking roots in the new country, a process that probably will later result in a dual citizenship, but for the time being lets the migrants experience living in the "already and not yet" Limbo of quasi-citizens.

In this sense, one could criticize the choice of using the term citizenship instead of membership or even identity. In fact, various scholars have reported about living in transnational settings and developing multiple social networks related to multiple identities, roles or memberships (DiMicco and Millen 2007; Zhao, Grasmuck and Martin. 2008; Shklovski et al. 2010; Shklovski 2011).

With reference to this criticism, we can answer on one hand that, by means of our interviews we have also revealed phenomena of multiple identities, mainly built through the use of multiple (and sometimes partially overlapped) accounts for playing different roles (for instance, an Indian boy had four Facebook profiles, for boys, girls, Italians, and foreigners) – in such cases, the feeling of double citizenship may be transverse to the sense of membership to the group, or community one belongs, or rather dispersed, such as in the example, in which the distinction between Italians and others was oriented to intentionally keep apart Italian speaking friends from English speaking.

On the other hand, the sense of belonging to multiple consortia (family, school, group of friends, etc.) is simultaneously managed within the borders of the virtual citizenship.

From all the interviews we understand that young immigrants try to use telecommunication technologies for two reasons:
1. for maintaining some roots in their motherland and keeping in touch with a social network from which they have been physically disconnected, with the high risk of losing important parts of their social capital (Mazzoni and Gaffuri 2009) - "without losing the tenderness of our elsewhere", as the Italian novelist Igiaba Scego, born from Somali parents, says in a recent interview;
2. for creating new acquaintances and friendships in their new country, both with natives and with other foreigners, not necessarily of their own nationality, as other studies have pointed out (Burrell and Anderson 2008): even those who declare that they have never met in the real life people originally known on the net, nevertheless they confess that social networks are their instrument of choice to establish new relationships with other peers. Some of them confess that they seldom contact people just for the sake of increasing the number of friends (three interviewees have more than 1,000 Facebook friends): this feeling contrasts with the results of a recent study (Tom Tong, Van Der Heide and Langwell 2008), that claims that attractiveness and social acceptance decrease when profile owners have an overabundance of connections.

Provided that adolescents declare that they are curious of what friends write on their wall in Facebook and that they often use the ‘Write a comment’ function, we believe that whenever they have in the same social network service two (or more) social networks made of friends of different nationalities, they can act as boundary spanners among the groups (Katz et al. 2004) and their wall can become a bridge among different cultures and catalyze cross-cultural fertilization.

Moreover, we do believe that this advantage might be reciprocal:

- on one side, the use and familiarity with social networks may help non-native students to adapt to their new place of residence (Frozzi and Mazzoni 2011), to become legally and socially accepted as Italian citizens, and to develop as responsible citizens able to positively contribute to the society; as Burke, Krant and Marlowe stated (2011), even "using the site to passively consume news assists those with lower social fluency draw value from their connections";
on the other side, Italian students may leverage their foreign relationships to become aware and appreciate different cultures – this process could profitably foster a shift from the practice of hospitality to the culture of cross-contamination.

This optimistic view may be obfuscated by some barriers: first of all, obviously, problems of comprehension of foreign languages; secondarily, problems related to different communication styles (Collis and Remmers 1997); and finally the different frequencies of interaction in relation to the spatial distance of contacts.

With reference to the last issue, we have verified that all our interviewees, independently from the cardinality of their social net (in Facebook 3 of them have less than 100 contacts; 3 more than 1,000 and the others an average of 234, with variance of 80), have a restricted number of friends which they contact frequently and that the frequency and intimacy of interactions is inversely proportional to the spatial proximity. This last observation could reduce expectations of cross-cultural exchanges through social networks connections.

On the other hand, a recent study (Benevenuto et al. 2009) based on the monitoring of clickstream data to identify patterns in social network use and social interaction has pointed out that browsing accounts for 92% of all user activities in online social networks. By paraphrasing Douglas and Isherwood (1996), we may say that connections are neutral, their uses are social: they can be used as fences or bridges, it is up to us exploiting them: we firmly believe that browsing walls of friends of different cultures shall facilitate inclusive processes; and that, according to Ellison et al. (2007), the weak social ties which are typical of the interaction on online social networks may allow users to build forms of bridging social capital (Putnam 2000; Schuller, Baron and Field 2001; Beugelsdijk and Smulders 2003) and networks of loose connections which, even if unable to provide emotional support (Granovetter 1983), may allow users to leverage “relationships from which they could potentially draw resources” (Ellison et al. 2007).

Moreover, latent ties (Haythornthwaite 2005; Frozzi and Mazzoni 2011), that is all those relational resources provided by social networking services under the form of friends of friends networks or friend suggestions (such as Facebook’s ‘People you may know’), form a mine of potential future weak ties which can be profitably used to enrich the bridging capital.

Eventually, in our educational perspective a problem could arise with those girls and boys who manage their social networks using two different social network services, because in such case the two communities would be separated. It should be noticed that, according to data of November 2007 on the overlap between online social network services, 26% of the users of Orkut and 24% of those of Hi5 had also a Facebook account (Patriquin 2007).

In those cases, a viable solution to share information between different platforms could be the use of applications such as myorkut, that connects an Orkut Profile to a Facebook Profile, so that the user can see the Orkut friends and read their messages in Facebook with no need to provide any login authentication after logging in to Facebook; or the diffusion of interoperability proposals such as OpenSocial, which defines a common API for social applications across multiple online social network services.

On the contrary, the rapid diffusion and increasing usage of circle-oriented social networking services, which do not disclose users’ actions to a large audience - after the failure of those based on the concept of “most frequently contacted friends”, such as the case of Google Buzz (Lehmann 2010) -, would operate in the opposite direction.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I wish to thank Peter Farsch, Michela Lanzanova and Anna Fasola for their contributions to this research, as well as Isacco Gregis and the girls and boys who accepted to be interviewed. As usual, Alessandra De Fiori fostered fruitful and pleasant conversations on the topic. I am grateful to Irina Shklovski for her helpful comments on a preliminary version of this paper.
REFERENCES


